# EFFECTIVE WETLANDS ENFORCEMENT

MACC Annual Environmental Conference March 5, 2016

Cynthia O'Connell, Conservation Agent, Town of Canton Rebekah Lacey, Counsel, Miyares and Harrington LLP

#### **Presentation Outline**

- Enforcement options
- Access to property
- Walk through escalating enforcement process
- What constitutes a violation?
- Whom to enforce against
- Case studies

# **Enforcement Options**

	WPA	MACC Model Bylaw
Notices of Violation	YES	YES
Enforcement Orders	YES	YES
Fines (Ticketing)	NO	YES
Court (Civil Action): Injunction Penalties	YES YES	YES NO
Court (Criminal Prosecution): Fines Imprisonment	YES YES	YES NO
Can DEP step in?	YES	NO

### Notice of Violation

- Requests (does not order) landowner to stop activity and contact the Commission
- No legal force and effect
- Does not require a high level of evidence before issuing
- Can be issued by agent without Commission vote
- NOV not required before Enforcement Order, but is advisable for due process reasons

# **Enforcement Order**

#### **WPA**

- Issued by:
  - Commission, OR
  - Agent or member if ratified by Commission at next mtg
- Must be issued within 2 years of violation
- Can both prohibit and require actions
- Cannot impose fines/ penalties
- Appeal is to Superior Court under c. 249, § 4

#### MACC Model Bylaw

Issued by Commission

- No specified statute of limitations
- Can both prohibit and require actions
- Cannot impose fines/ penalties
- Appeal is to Superior Court under c. 249, § 4

### **Enforcement Order Best Practices**

- Document evidence of violation
- Be very clear and specific about:
  - Findings: Facts and law regarding violation
  - Requirements and deadlines
- Do not use NOI/OOC process for restoration
  - NOI/OOC process can be used for after-the-fact permitting of alteration that may be approvable
- Give violator due process
  - Notice
  - Opportunity to be heard

# **Fines and Penalties**

- Under WPA:
  - \$25,000/day **penalty** can be sought with civil complaint
  - \$25,000/day fine can be sought with criminal complaint
- Under MACC Model Bylaw, Commission can impose up to \$300/day fine
  - Collect via criminal prosecution, or
  - Collect via ticketing procedure of Chapter 40, § 21D, or
  - Settle with violator for agreed amount.
- Correcting common misconceptions:
  - No bylaw can impose fines of more than \$300/day or civil penalty
  - Bylaw fines may not be added to tax bill and collected via lien
  - Enforcement order cannot impose fine or penalty

#### Chapter 40, § 21D Ticketing Procedure

- Municipality (Town Meeting or City Council) must:
  - Accept c. 40, § 21D specifically for wetland bylaw
  - Specify exact fine amount per violation (not "up to")
  - Specify enforcing agent
- Enforcing agent must:
  - Use form approved by District Court (see handouts)
  - Issue ticket to violator at time and place of violation, or mail to violator within 15 days
  - Send copy to clerk of district court
- Violator can appeal within 21 days by sending a written request for a hearing to the district court

SAMPLE NONCRIMINAL MUNICIPAL CITATION FORM FOR USE PURSUANT TO G.L. C. 40, § 21D Approved by the Chief Justice of the District Court Department EFFECTIVE MARCH 21, 1991

CITY [or TOWN] OF [Name] NOTIO OF CITY ORDINANCE [or TOWN BY-LAW]	
DATE OF NOTICE	NOTICE NO.
NAME OF OFFENDER	I
ADDRESS OF OFFENDER	
CITY, STATE, ZIP CODE	DOB OF OFFENDER
MV OPERATOR LICENSE NO. MV/MB REGISTRATI	ON NO.
OFFENSE (s)	
DATE & TIME OF VIOLATION	
LOCATION OF VIOLATION	
SIGNATURE OF ENFORCING PERSON	ENFORCING DEPT.
I HEREBY ACKNOWLEDGE RECEIPT OF TH	E FOREGOING CITATION
X Unable to obtain signature of offender.	Date Mailed
THE NONCRIMINAL FINE FOR THIS OFFENS YOU HAVE THE FOLLOWING ALTERNAT Either option (1) or option (2) will operate as a final disposi (1) You may pay the above noncriminal fine, through an authorized agent, or by mailing a check, m 21 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THIS NOTICE to: [ <i>City or Town Clerk</i> : [ <i>Address</i> ]. (2) You may contest this matter by making a hearing before a court magistrate WITHIN 21 DAYS to: Clerk-Magistrate, [ <i>Name</i> ] Dis [ <i>Address</i> ] Attn: 21D Noncriminal he: (3) If you do not pay the noncriminal fine or requ you do not appear for the hearing or pay any fine complaint may be issued against you.	TVES IN THIS MATTER: tion, with no resulting criminal record. either by appearing in person or noney order or postal note WITHIN written request for a noncriminal OF THE DATE OF THIS NOTICE trict Court arings. Just a hearing within 21 days, or if
☐ I elect Option (1) above, confess the violation of check, money order or postal note in the amount of \$_ the number of this notice on my check, money order of this notice.	. I have written
□ I elect Option (2) above and request a noncrimi enclosed a copy of this notice and my name and curr	
Signature	

#### 21D citation form approved by District Court

#### http://www.mass.gov/courts/ forms/dc/dc-forms-gen.html

TOWN OF NORTH ANDOVER NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF WETLAND BYLAW

2006 the local models
Need of anyopen
KONEN OF INTEREE
THY, MARE TH COME
NO OPERATOR CODER NAMED. NAME AND ADDRESS OF ADDRESS.
OTTENSE:
Yole And Date of Vocalities (A.M.) (P.M.) ON
AT INCIDENT VICENSE
proving to percent reacts
THEREBY ACKNOWLEDGE RECEIPT OF THE FOREGOING CITATION
X
Unable to obtain signature of offender. Date Malled     Otation mailed to offender
THE FINE FOR THIS NON CRIMINAL OFFENSE IS 8
YOU HAVE THE FOLLOWING ALTERNATIVES WITH REGARD TO DISPOSITION OF THIS MALTER.
(1) You may elect to pay the above fine, either by appearing in person
between 830 A.M and 430 F.M. Monday through Friday, legal holidays
excepted, Settive: The Conservation Office, Town Hall, 125 Main SI, North
Andover, MA 01845 OR by mailing a check, money order or postal reste to the Conservation Office INITHIN TWENTY-ONE (21) DAVIS OF THE DATE
OF THIS NOTICE. This will operate as a final disposition of the matter, with
no resulting criterial record.
(2) If you desire to contest this matter in a non-criminal proceeding, you
may do so by making a written request, and encipsing a copy of this citation.
WITHIN THIENTY-ONE (21) DAYS OF THE DATE OF THIS NOTICE TO
The Clerk Magistrate, Lawrence District Court
They developed the interaction with mentals

Two Appleton St., Lawrence, MA 01940

ATTN: Civil Clerk

[2] If you fail to pay the above fine or to appear as specified, a criminal complaint may be neved against you.

A LINEREDY ELECT the first option above, confess to the affertaet charged, and enclose payment in the amount of \$

B. IHEREBY REQUEST a non-oriminal hearing on this matter.

Signature \_\_\_\_

WHITE OFFENDENTS COPY YELLOW CONSERVATION COPY PINK: COURT COPY

#### TOWN OF NORTH ANDOVER NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF WETLAND BYLAW DATE DOUBLE of OFFERSTREES. of the local division in which the

353

OTY, MUNICIPAL CODE	an and	STATION STATION COMPOSE
AN OF DRUCE AND ADDRESS	MOMENTS	CONTRACTOR DE LA CONTRACT
SFREME		
	_	
ear web same of recurrent (A.M.) (P.M.) (PM sociation of recurrent T		

REBY ADRIVOWLEDGE RECEIPT OF THE FOREGOING CITATION

Unable to obtain signature at offender. Date Maleid Cilation mailed to offender

#### FINE FOR THIS NON-CRIMINAL OFFENSE IS \$ UHAVE THE FOLLOWING ALTERNATIVES WITH REGARD TO POSITION OF THIS MATTER.

0 You may elect to pay the above fine, either by appearing in person. ween 8:30 A.M and 4:30 P.M., Monday through Friday, legal holidays septed, before. The Conservation Office. Town Hall, 120 Main St., Northdover, MA 01845 OR by mailing a check, money order or postal note to Conservation Office WITHIN TWENTY-ONE (21) DAYS OF THE DATE. THIS NOTICE. This will operate as a final disposition of the matter, with resulting criminal record.

If you desire to contest this matter in a non-criminal proceeding, you willo so by making a written request, and enclosing a copy of this platton THIN TWENTY ONE (21) DAYS OF THE DATE OF THIS NOTICE TO

The Clerk-Magistrate, Lewrence District Court

- Two Appleton St., Lawrence, MA 01840
- ATTN: Ove Clerk

[3] If you fail to pay the above fine or to appear as specified, a criminal compliaint may be issued against you.

A THEREBY ELECT the first option above, confess to the offense charged, and enclose payment in the amount of \$\_\_\_\_\_

B. IHEREBY REQUEST a non-original bearing on this matter.

#### Signature .....

WHITE OFFENDER'S COPY VELLOW CONSERVATION COPY PINK: COURT COPY

	TOWN OF NORTH ANDOVER
	NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF WETLAND BYLAW
1	ATTENTING SOTIES
	MAR OF OWNERS
	AND DE COMPANY
1	dowess of officiality
1	DIV, ATMR, MP DOLE
	an opportunity of the second
2	SPIERE
1	
1	
0	SAM) SPIM) ON
,	Served Screen out
	A7
	EGENTURY OF DAVAGINE PERSON
	Unable to obtain signature of stillender. Data Maleid Citation mailed to offender
ļ	THE FINE FOR THIS NON CRIMINAL OFFENSE IS \$ 100 HAVE THE FOLLOWING ALTERNATIVES WITH RECAILD TO DISPOSITION OF THIS MATTER.
	(1) You may elect to pay the above fire, either by appearing in per- tedwater #30 A.M and 4.30 P.M., Monday through Friday, legel hold escapted, before. The Conservation Office, Town Hall, 120 Main 51, N
	Andover, MA 01845 OR by making a check, money order or potellal net the Conservation Office WTHMI TWENTY-ONE (21) DAVIS OF THE IX OF THES NOTICE. The will operate as a final disposition of the malitim, too resulting criminal record.
	(2) If you desire to context this matter in a non-criminal proceeding, may do so by making a written request, and enclosing a copy of this one
	WITHIN TWENTY CHE (21) DAYS OF THE DATE OF THIS NOTICE TO The Clerk Allegistratis, Lawrence Dated Court
	Two Appleton St., Lawrence, MA 01840
	ATTN: Child Cliefs (2) If you fail to pay the above fine or to appear as specified, a criminal
	compliant may be issued against you.
	A LINEREEV ELECT the first option above, converse to the offense
	sharged, and enclose payment in the amount of \$
	charged, and enclose payment in the amount of 8

WHITE OFFENDER'S COPY YELLOW CONSERVATION COPY PINK COURT COPY

### **Court Actions**

- WPA violations
  - Superior Court civil action:
    - Injunctive relief (i.e. order to violator to take actions)
    - Penalty (up to \$25,000/day)
  - Criminal complaint in District Court:
    - Fines (up to \$25,000/day)
    - Imprisonment (rare)
- Bylaw violations
  - Superior Court civil action:
    - Injunctive relief only
  - Criminal complaint in District Court:
    - Fines only (up to \$300/day)

#### **DEP Enforcement Actions**

- For significant violations of the WPA within past two years
- DEP can take administrative enforcement actions
  - Compliance Orders
  - Penalty Assessment Notices
- Note that once DEP starts enforcement action, the Conservation Commission cannot take action on the same violations
  - See Westminster Conservation Commission v. SBT Holdings, Inc. litigation (state and federal court)

### Access to Property: Options

- Obtain consent
  - In person or in writing from owner or other authorized person (e.g., tenant)
  - Site access clauses in permit application and order of conditions
- View from off-property
  - Adjacent properties (with permission)
  - Public areas
  - Air (caution re: low-flying planes and drones)
- Obtain an administrative warrant
- Emergency situations

# Obtaining an Administrative Warrant

- If violation is bylaw-only, confirm that bylaw confers authority to enter
- Complete application, affidavit, and warrant; do not sign
- Go to local district court
  - Find office of civil (not criminal) clerk
  - Ask to speak to an assistant clerk
  - Present papers to assistant clerk and explain situation
  - Sign application and affidavit in presence of assistant clerk; assistant clerk will sign warrant

# Example Escalating Enforcement Process for Significant Violation

- Gathering of information and evidence (with administrative warrant if necessary)
- Notice of Violation
- Enforcement Order (can accompany with ticketing for violation of bylaw requirements)
- Ticketing for violation of Enforcement Order (bylaw only)
- Letter from Town Counsel (optional but often effective)
- Court action

#### What constitutes a violation?

#### Wetlands Protection Act:

"No person shall **remove**, **fill**, **dredge or alter** any area subject to protection under this section without the required authorization, or cause, suffer or allow such activity, or **leave in place unauthorized fill**, or otherwise **fail to restore illegally altered land** to its original condition, or **fail to comply with an enforcement order** issued pursuant to this section."

#### MACC Model Bylaw:

"No person shall **remove**, **fill**, **dredge**, **build upon**, **degrade**, **or otherwise alter** resource areas protected by this bylaw, or cause, suffer, or allow such activity, **or leave in place unauthorized fill**, or otherwise **fail to restore illegally altered land** to its original condition, or **fail to comply with a permit or an enforcement order** issued pursuant to this bylaw."

#### Whom to enforce against?

- Landowner
- Tenant
- Contractor
- Third party





# CASE STUDIES

#### **Riverfront Tree Removal**



#### **Riverfront Tree Removal**



# **Case Study - Residential**



#### **Violation Letter**



Town of Canton Conservation Commission

Pequitside Farm 79 Pieasant Street Canton, Massachusetts 02021 Telephone (781)-821-5035 Fax (781) 821-5456

Debra Sundin, Member

Janna Shub, Member

Gerald Carmichael, Member

Steven Landry, Chairman Robert MacDenald, Vice-Chair Donald MacAdam, Treasurer James Fitzpatrick, Clerk

Cynthia B. O'Connell, Agent Heather Cahill, Administrative Assistant

#### September 21, 2015



Canton, Massachusetts 02021

It has come to my attention that there may be a wetland violation at your property located at Street, Canton, Massachusetts. I was informed that there was grading and vegetation removal taking place at the rear of the property, possibly within the 100' Buffer Zone to the wetland resource area on the abutting parcel to the oreth.

Pursuant to an inspection that I conducted on September 11, 2015, I observed what appeared to be an area of fill and vegetation removal at the rear of your property. As you may or may not know, any work or activity in a wetland resource area, within 100 feet of a wetland or within 200 feet of a river is subject to review and approval by the Conservation Commission, pursuant to its authority under the Massachusetts Wetland Protection Act and the Town of Canton Wetlands Protection By-law. Your property contains portions of the 100° Buffer Zone. Any alteration, including vegetation removal and filling, within these areas without prior approval from the Commission constitutes a violation of the Act and the By-law.

The Conservation Commission is anxious to have this matter resolved as quickly as possible and to bring your property into compliance with state and local regulations. The Commission requests that you attend its regularly scheduled meeting on October 14, 2015 to discuss this issue. Should you have any questions or need additional information, please contact the Conservation Office (781-821-5035/coconnell@itown.canton.ma.us). Thank you for your prompt attention to this matter.

For the Canton Conservation Commission

lear

Cynthia B. O'Connell, ASLA, RLA Conservation Agent

÷...

# Remedial Work in Response to Violation letter



#### Fill placed on pond bank



#### **Enforcement Order**

28	Massachusetts Department of Environmental Pro Bureau of Resource Protection - Wetlands WPA Form 9 – Enforcement Order Massachusetts Wetlands Protection Act M.G.L. c. 13		DEP File Number			
	A. Violation Information	1, 940				
	A. violation information					
When filling out	This Enforcement Order is issued by:					
forms on the	Centon	June 19, 2015				
computer, use only the tab	Conservation Commission (Jasuing Authority)	Date				
key to move	To:					
your cursor - do not use the						
raibum kery.	Nation of Mediator					
- I	Address					
-X	1. Location of Violation:					
	Extracts Output (7 Alfament)					
	Street Address	682033				
	Canton	02021				
	Assessors Map Plat Number	Percei/Lot Number				
	2. Extent and Type of Activity (if more space is required, please attach a separate sheet):					
	Atteration of the Bank of the Bank of the Pond, siteration of the 100' Buffer Zone to the Bank of Pond, installation of a fixed baat dock without the benefit of a Chapter 91 license from DEP. Photographs of the violations were submitted by an abuffer on June 18 & 19, 2015. Additional Cention residents have contacted the Commission and other town officials regarding the violation.					
	Under the Massachusetts Wetlands Protection Act (310 CMR 10.00): By conducting work within an Area Subject to Protection (wetland and buffer zone) without filing a Notice of Intent, the Wetlands Act, G.L.G. 131, sec. 40 and the Wetlands Regulations, 310 CMR 10.05(4) and the Town of Ganton Wetlands Protection By-taw, Article XX.					
	B. Findings					

apatomia da ros. 1940a

Page 1 (24



Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection Bureau of Resource Protection - Wetlands WPA Form 9 - Enforcement Order Massachusetts Wetlands Protection Act M.G.L. c. 131, §40

DEP File Number:

Conservation Commission signatures required on following page.

#### D. Appeals/Signatures (cont.)

Canton Conservation Community

In a situation regarding immediate action, an Enforcement Oxfer may be signed by a single memoar or agent of the Commission and reafied by insignify of the members at the next scheduled meeting of the Commission.

Signatures: Connell Onworking & On Thurst Courter

Signature of delivery person or carshed multimether

VERNING DO-TH THEFT

Paperson

#### Post-enforcement Order – fill removed



### Access



# Result



#### Questions?

Cynthia O'Connell coconnell@town.canton.ma.us

Rebekah Lacey rlacey@miyares-harrington.com